The essence of the art of a midwife: holistic, multidimensional meanings and experiences explored through creative inquiry

A dissertation submitted to the University of the West of England in partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Education by Jennifer Susan Hall

Faculty of Arts, Creative Industries and Education, University of the West of England

March 2012
In the process of the five years of this study there have been a considerable number of people who have walked along the path with me, supporting in different ways, as only individuals can. I apologise if I miss anyone from this list, but if I do, please recognise that I appreciated you.

Thanks firstly must go to those who have supervised me over the EdD; Martin Ashley and Saville Kushner, who gave me the opportunity to start the programme; Jacky Brine, who challenged and supported as my original Director of Studies. But primarily Lynn Raphael- Reed, who has sat alongside me through some difficult times while gently advising and guiding and allowing me the freedom to explore and experiment. You have been a true mentor and I hope to follow your example. Thank you.

Thanks go to the midwives who were prepared to share their stories and ‘play’ along with me in the context of the study. I am grateful for your willingness to be so open. In doing so you have revealed the reality of being a midwife in the NHS today, which, hopefully maybe of help to others.

To my EdD cohort, especially, Fiona, Lynn, Faye, Richard and Alan and all the others who have been stimulating ‘co- eddies’, have challenged and inspired and have made me laugh! Thank you for the fun.

To my work colleagues, who have been incredibly patient and supportive and put up with extra work load from me at times: I owe you.

To my friends who have put up with seeing me less and having me less ‘with it’: thanks for being there and helping me through.

To Becky Reed and The Practising Midwife journal: special thanks to you for loaning the photos for this study.

To my daughters, who have grown up considerably in the time of this thesis, who have lived with the mess, more take-aways and have not understood what this is all about. I hope one day you will read it and see that you have been part of this story,
and have impacted on it. I am sorry for being so distracted at times, but you are always in my heart.

Finally, to my husband Mark: you know this study is yours too, that you have lived it alongside me and have put up with late night working, more house work than you should be doing, extra running around with the children, and no dining room for years! I could not have done this without you and I truly love you and appreciate who you are.

This work is dedicated to my parents, Ken and Maggie, who have had some tough times over the past few years. I hope you are proud of me.
Table of Contents

The front of the quilt 1

Section 1: Introduction to the journey: 2

The research questions: 3

Figure 1: Timeline for the process of the study 4

Section 2: The roots of my enquiry: 5

2:1 Personal history: 5

2:2 Midwifery professionalism - a short history: 7

2:3 Midwifery education - a short history: 8

2:4 Back to the journey before the journey 13

2:5 The ontological basis of the study: holistic principles, spirituality and creative art 15

2:5:1 Holism 15

2:5:2 Spirituality 17

2:5:3 Creativity 19

Section 3: Grounding the study 21

3:1 Being a midwife 21

3:2 The art of midwifery 22

3:3 Holistic care and midwifery 25

3:4 Education for holistic care and artistry 26

3:5 Creativity and midwifery education 27

3:6 Knowledges of the research 27

3:7 Considering validity 31
Section 4: Mapping the methodological landscape 34

4:1 Arts-based methodology 35
4:2 The methodological roundabout 36

Section 5: The journey unfolding 38

5:1 The steps I have taken 38
5:2 Ethical considerations 38
5:3 Changing directions 39
Figure 5:1 Study pictures 43
Figure 5:2 Study Words describing the meaning of midwifery 44

Section 6: Quilting as reflexive response 45

6:1 Myself of the path 45

Section 7: Crafting the bricolage 54

7:1 A junction: putting the pieces together 54
Figure 7:1 Phases of interpretation of vignettes 64
Figure 7:2 Colours for the statements in interpretation 65
Figure 7:3 Text quilt 67a

Section 8: Multi-dimensional meanings of the essence of being a midwife 68

8.1 Who are the participants? 68
Table 1: Details about the midwife participants from questionnaire 69
8.2 The research questions 70
8.3 Mapping the text quilts 71
Figure 8:1 Text quilts 71
8:3:1 Pamela's quilt 73

Figure 8:2: Pamela- Text quilt Opposites 74

Figure 8:3 Pairing of words 75

Figure 8:4 Pamela text quilt interpretation squares 79

8:3:2 Looking at all four text quilts together 84

Figure 8:5 Kerry’s text quilt from different angles 86

8:3:3 Asking the midwives their views 87

8: 4 Thematic analysis: meanings of being a midwife 88

8:4:1 The essence of a midwife 89

Personal significance 89

The type of midwife you are 92

Importance of the impact of the role 95

8:4:2 The art of practice 99

Holistic and individualised care 99

A belief in normality 101

8:4:3 The physical aspects of midwifery 104

Personal physical reactions 104

Physical Working environment 107

Physical aspects of caring 118

Time 121

8:4:4 Psychological and emotional aspects of midwifery 123

Positive emotions in midwifery 123

Negative emotions in midwifery 124

Need for emotional support 128

Meeting emotional needs of women 132
8:4:5 Spiritual aspects of being a midwife 134

The midwifery role as spiritual 134

Spiritual care 136

Instinct/intuition 137

Spiritual nature of birth 144

8:4:6 Social context of midwifery 146

Balancing personal relationships 146

The importance of relationships with women 150

Trust and lies 159

8: 5 Using creative inquiry 162

8:5:1 Looking at pictures 162

8:5:2 Interpreting the first pictures 162

Figure 8:6 Looking at the first pictures 163

Colour 164

Images 164

Figure 8:7 The participants explanation of the first pictures 165

8:5:3 Interpreting the second interview pictures 166

Figure 8:8 Pictures from the second interviews 167

Creating the picture 169

Choosing the pictures 169

Centralising the woman 171

Talking about practice 171

Figure 8:9: The midwives talking about the second pictures 172

Examining the pictures 185

8:5:4 The education session 186

Views of the session 186
Impact of the session 188

Section 9: Discussing the findings 192

9:1 Meaning of being a midwife 192
  
  Midwifery as personal identity 192
  Importance of being a midwife to them 194
  Division in the profession 196

9:2 Art of practice 196

9:2:1 Physical demands of being midwives 197
  
  Working Environment 198
  Physical aspects of care 199
  Time 200

9:2:2 Psychological and Emotional 200
  
  Emotional responses 200
  Need for support 202

9:2:3 Spiritual issues 203
  
  Spiritual care 203
  Intuition. 204
  Significance of birth 205

9:2:4 Social issues 206
  
  Personal relationships 206
  Relationships with women 207
  Public health role 208
  Partner relationship 208
  Mothering by midwives 209
  Trust and lies 209

9:3 Final Statement 210
Section 10: Finishing the quilt 212

10:1 The essence of a Midwife 212
10:2 The art of practice 212
10:3 The holistic aspects of midwifery 212
   10:3:1 Physical aspects 212
   10:3:2 Psychological and Emotional aspects 213
   10:3:3 Spiritual aspects 213
   10:3:4 Social context of midwifery 213
10:4 Use of creative inquiry 213
   10:4:1 The use of multidimensional ‘text quilts’ 213
   10:4:2 Using creative methods 214
   10:4:3 Discussing the use of art 215
10:5 Reaching some kind of end 215
10:6 Finishing the quilt 217
   10:7 Sending the quilt out to the world 220

The back of the quilt 224

References 225

Appendix 249